CJSAC the canadian journal for the study of adult education

> la revue canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes rcééa

THE GIFT OF WIT(H)NESSING TRANSITIONAL MOMENTS THROUGH A CONTEMPLATIVE ARTS CO-INQUIRY

Susan Walsh and Barbara Bickel

The Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education/ La revue canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes Editor-in-Chief: Robert Mizzi Special Edition Editors: Kathy Mantas and Carole Roy www.cjsae-rceea.ca

> 32,2 October/octobre 2020, 137–154 ISSN1925-993X (online)

© Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education/ L'Association canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes www.casae-aceea.ca

THE GIFT OF WIT(H)NESSING TRANSITIONAL MOMENTS THROUGH A CONTEMPLATIVE ARTS CO-INQUIRY

Susan Walsh

Mount Saint Vincent University

Barbara Bickel

Southern Illinois University

Abstract

In this article, we offer glimpses of a contemplative arts co-inquiry that we recently undertook: our primary purpose was to wit(h)ness one another as we reimagine our lives and work. Briefly, we are white, Canadian-born female professors of European settler heritage living on the traditional lands of the Indigenous peoples of Treaties 6 and 7, and Métis Region 3 and 4, who have been living in the transitional spaces of leaving the academy for the past two years. We share a deep personal and social commitment to engaging with contemplative arts practices in relational ways in our daily lives, as well as in our teaching and research. We became interested in wit(h)nessing one another through a co-inquiry that offered the opportunity for us to explore more deeply the transitional spaces we now occupy—and to foreground the inter-relational healing aspects of the process, both personally and in relation to the potentialities for broader social transformation. Our co-inquiry involves visual and textual offerings that embody wit(h)nessing as a creative and contemplative act—in the service of intentionally being with moments of relationality and reciprocity.

Résumé

Nous offrons un aperçu d'une récente enquête coopérative contemplative et artistique. Notre principal objectif était de (co)témoigner de la ré imagination de nos vies et de notre travail. Comme professeures blanches nées au Canada dont les ancêtres étaient des colonisateurs européens, nous habitons les terres traditionnelles des peuples autochtones des traités numéros 6 et 7 et des Métis de la région 3 et 4, et, depuis deux ans, habitons également les espaces transitionnels du départ de l'académie. Nous partageons un profond engagement personnel et social à la pratique quotidienne d'arts contemplatifs et relationnels dans notre enseignement et dans nos recherches. Nous nous sommes intéressées au (co)témoignage par l'enquête coopérative qui permet d'explorer plus profondément les espaces transitionnels occupés et de souligner

> The Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education/ La revue canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes 32,2 October/octobre 2020, 137–154 ISSN1925-993X (online) © Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education/ L'Association canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes

138 Walsh/Bickel, "THE GIFT OF WIT(H)NESSING TRANSITIONAL MOMENTS"

×

les aspects interrelationnels guérisseurs du processus sur les plans personnel et d'une potentielle transformation sociale plus large. Notre enquête coopérative comprend des éléments visuels et textuels qui incarnent le (co)témoignage comme geste créateur et contemplatif, et ce, au service d'une présence intentionnelle dans les moments de relationnalité et de réciprocité.

I arrive walk campus inside out for two full days before the course begins skin slippery breezeless air unseasonably hot humid I reacquaint myself with the east coast my colleagues attend to a tangle of thoughts feelings pray set intentions attune to energies in the space where the course will manifest

may this course unfold in spacious and organic ways for the benefit of all involved and beyond

may we re-member to open to life energy moment by moment

on our first day together twenty graduate students and I ponder our collective intentions what do we aspire to in working together? how do we co-create a compassionate respectful space for learning?

and then through textures pieces of fabric lace yarn we etch personal intentions what do I wish for through this experience? what does my heart want? what do I bring to this work in community? textile squares strung together like prayer flags send aspirations with the wind



Figure 1. Materializing intentions. Photo: S. Walsh.

teardrops fall into open space eye of diamond crystal clear

A receptacle of threads spun in collaborative ways with tenderness and compassion, this article is a labour of love stitched into each page with poetic, visual, performative, expository prose, and reflective writing that offers glimpses of a contemplative arts co-inquiry that we recently undertook. Our overall aspiration was to wit(h)ness one another as we move with&in transitional spaces and re-member and re-imagine our lives and work. Acknowledging that the experience of collaboration is greater than each of us as individuals, we invite you, as readers/viewers, into an open textual-image space that is porous and relational, and that allows experience to steep, breathe, and hold different, evolving meanings for each of us. Welcome.

To briefly share our historic and lived locations, we are white, Canadian-born female professors of European settler heritage, currently residing as visitors in the Province of Alberta on the traditional Indigenous lands of Treaties 6 and 7 and Métis Regions 3 and 4. Now resettled in two different prairie cities, each of us has been living into the transitional spaces of leaving the academy for the past two years. We share a deep personal and social commitment to engaging with contemplative arts practices in relational ways in our daily lives, as well as in our teaching, writing, and research. As one of our last institutionally offered courses (at least in our current academic incarnations), we planned and taught parallel intensive summer courses in the area of arts-based, holistic, and contemplative education in Faculties of Education at two Canadian universities. We structured the parallel courses loosely as contemplative arts retreats; we planned the courses in collaborative

ways over approximately six months and then taught our individual iterations of the summer courses over less than two weeks. In our initial debriefing after completing the courses, we each independently described our teaching experiences as healing: healing of the accumulated trauma we have both experienced as spiritual feminists working in the isolating patriarchal neoliberal institution of higher education. We became interested in wit(h)nessing one another as we explored more deeply the transitional spaces we now occupy. Thus, our co-inquiry embodies wit(h)nessing as a creative and contemplative act: intentionally experiencing moments of relationality and reciprocity, something we see as imperative in broader social contexts.

Through our interconnected wit(h)nessing processes, we engage with what artist, writer, and art critic Suzi Gablik (1992) calls "connective aesthetics"-a paradigmatic shift from modern consumer-based aesthetics, to that of an ethical socially based aesthetic that is concerned with "[m]aintaining a deeply connected relationship with society," each other, and the other-than-human world (p. 2). Connective aesthetics is porous and relational, moving beyond what is solid and individual; it includes listening and viewing and calls us to attend to both self and other with respect, compassion, and care. As a form of inquiry, we engage an expanded practice of witnessing, or what Bracha Ettinger (1999) names wit(h)nessing, as an approach to inquiry that involves the intentional creation of space for deep listening, compassionate conjoinment, and artistic artworkings. Ettinger (1999) extends understandings of connective aesthetics with her matrixial articulation of the eros-agape infused event of art-making and art-encounters. The art event holds the potential for the healing of conscious and non-conscious trauma through wit(h)nessing the other. Ettinger opens pathways through matrixial theory for what can take place in the liminal zone of art and encourages each of us to engage the world as a "woman artist," attuned to connective aesthetics as the precedent to political and ethical acts in the world. She writes, "In the matrixial borderspace, the artist as a partial subject takes part and testifies to/for an unknown other or rather, it is the matrixial threads of the artwork which testify to the traumas of an-other in wit(h)ness" (pp. 93-94).

Although our own relationships with teaching-and the shape of our lives in generalare more fluid and shifting than usual at present, throughout our co-inquiry, we held clear intentions for co-creating an open and connective space for wit(h)nessing one another. We held one another's offerings in open spaces of deep listening and care, and responded to one another and ourselves through a range of contemplative arts practices. In this way, the form of our co-inquiry complements the focus of the parallel courses and also our pedagogical and personal commitments. We drew on our previous research experiences with women in collective contexts, on our personal arts and spiritual practices, and also on our teaching experiences. We met at a distance through video conferencing over the course of several months and engaged with contemplative arts practices such as writing, visual art, sewing, movement, and vocal improvisation: bringing ourselves always back-and back again-to trusting the wisdom of whatever arose through our creative processing, as stories, feelings, insights, and associations emerged. Our online meetings included Indigenous land acknowledgements and the creation of ritual space, as well as cycles of free writing, sharing, and art-making, all of which are ways of wit(h)nessing-attending to the other and to the self-as self-other co-evolve and shift in a shared space-time. At times, we also considered artifacts from our courses (i.e. teaching plans, journal entries, artwork that emerged during the courses, etc.).

Further, the writing of this article brings us to another dimension of creative processing that yields even deeper insights. We engage the layout of the page metaphorically in a hand over hand stitching practice, aligning the text and images left or right on the page, thus manifesting a visual space-between that highlights the fluid relationality of our co-labour and its rich generativity: a space that tenderly holds our intentions of listening deeply and wit(h)nessing.¹ We gift one another through our co-labour. We do this with a spirit of gratitude, humbly acknowledging the source as from a place greater than our individual selves (Hyde, 2007).

We begin with simple ritual...



Embodying Wit(h)nessing Practice

Figure 2. Art and ritual. Photo: S. Walsh.

Susan acknowledges with gratitude the influences of her previous writing with Heesoon Bai, a writing-witnessing process whereby two researchers shared and contemplated pieces of writing through deep, intentional, care-filled listening and meditation that involved being still and open to the fresh images and words that arose in textual spaces-between (Walsh & Bai, 2015, 2017). The writing-witnessing process in the 2015 work also included a left and right justified structure, a textual representation of the container we co-created for holding one another's words.



Figure 3. Barbara candle lighting. Photo: B. Bickel.

candles connected flames awareness of fields tuning into energy fields prayers setting intentions coming back to the ground spiritual teachings co-creating a healing restorative space collaborative open flexible respectful feeling loss grief co-inquiry witnessing intentions what do we need?

> I need structure I want to perform this I want to physically move with through it I want to be wit(h)nessed I hold so much I keep so much in my body I can share what is in my body I can share what I carry "carriance"2 I am carried I carry others part of the grief is the loss of relationships with students not sustaining relationships I came

² See Bracha Ettinger (2014) video. "The world is gone, I must carry you": Daring the shock of *emun* (trust), on the transjective subreal in art and psychoanalysis. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=A3hbixTlncU

I carried I put them down left them to return to their own lives I offered ongoing communication but none took my offer the institutional teacher-student pattern I had as a student now live as a teacher the disconnection of connection is painful how to bring closure to what was opened all the teaching learning the good the bad with my entire body I can perform grief I can perform grief with my entire body my body performs to un-perform itself through what it has carried I feel sadness heavy on my face holding my neck compressing my chest letting down



Figure 4. Barbara in movement I. Photo: B. Bickel.

tension and release clarity things held tightly in the body breath shallow face clenched breath opening exhaling opening release hand on the side of the belly inward outward various directions generational layers stitching across mother grandmother daughter granddaughter small stitches so neat and tidy exactness feeling the harshness of doing things right fear not feeling safe directions of my stitches so tight orderly an overcast stitch a mistake a misstep noticing tension and a memory of my mom frozen solid unable to put a pencil line on a piece of paper



Figure 5. Sewing across generations. Photo: S. Walsh.

Barbara moving freely her body expressive releasing what is held was held we are attending to wounds scars a memory of me watching a dance class peeking under the door seeing girls moving freely joyously feeling I was not allowed had to do more structured forms of dance compete it's either right or wrong how do we work through untraining bodymindspirit unhinging harshness from structure

> body body wrapping body carrying body holding body caring body remembering body training body releasing body managing body disciplining



Figure 6. Barbara in movement II. Photo: B. Bickel.

body good and harsh body speaking out loud body freeing body supporting bodies being bodies together generationally reworking stitches across time so many stitches still connected not cut to cut now

with intentional com/passion

Threads of our Colleagues in our Co-inquiry

We gratefully acknowledge the co-labour of our colleagues and the conscious and non-conscious threads of their intellectual and creative gifts, threads that interweave lovingly throughout our co-inquiry. "The labour of gratitude accomplishes the transformation that a gift promises...The gifted become one with their gifts" (Hyde, 2007, p. 71). Our work as teacher educators and researchers has grown through years of engagement with spiritual practices that serve to situate our co-inquiry within holistic and contemplative education. In particular, we have worked within feminist, earth-based, and Tibetan Buddhist traditions personally and professionally (e.g. Brown, 2001; Cixous, 1993, 1997; Ettinger, 1999; Fernandes, 2003; Gradle, 2006; Klein, 1995; Lange, 2004; Mattis-Namgyel, 2010; Starhawk, 1989). Intuitive and holistic (nondual, embodied) being, knowing, and not-knowing as well as intentional, respectful engagement with the Earth and all sentient beings form the ground for our pedagogy, research, and ways of being in the world; respect, relationality, reciprocity, and co-emergence are central.

We also acknowledge the influences of our colleagues who work in holistic and contemplative education (e.g. Bai et al., 2009; Bai & Scott, 2011; Binder, 2016; Eppert et al., 2015; Eppert & Wang, 2008; Gunnlaugson et al., 2017; Kumar, 2013; Miller, 2013; Palmer et al., 2010; Seidel & Jardine, 2014; Smith, 2014; Zajonc, 2003, 2009). More specifically, we desire to foreground the work of colleagues who engage with arts-based practices (e.g. dance, movement, contemplative photography, visual art, vocal improvisation, poetry) as

forms of contemplation that are holistic, intuitive, embodied, and relational forms of inquiry and teaching (Bhattacharya & Payne, 2016; Binder, 2016; Fisher, 2017; Franklin, 2017; Jordan, 2013; Kelly, 2015; Irwin & de Cosson, 2004; Neilsen, 2004; Snowber, 2016). Many of the contemplative practices taken up in the above teaching and research contexts—and in the broader social context—draw upon practices derived from diverse ancient wisdom traditions and worldviews, practices through which people connect energetically with the natural-spiritual worlds (for example, Puja ceremony, labyrinth walking, Indigenous creative apprenticeships, and contemplative arts practices such as Miksang/contemplative photography).

As we pull ourselves through the needle of our co-inquiry, we feel deeply the gifts of learning we have been given in the academy—a whole range of human experiences—we also send love and gratitude to all of the women and men with whom we have worked in previous research and teaching contexts over many years, cited and not cited below; their influences resonate in this relational space and shape our co-inquiry and everyday being in the world (see, for example, Bickel et al., 2018; Gradle & Bickel, 2010; Bickel & Gu, 2015; Bickel & Hugill, 2011; Bickel & Sims, 2014; Bickel & Wendt, 2015; CORE, 2006; Counternormativity Discourse Group, 2005; Fisher & Bickel, 2015; Gannon et al., 2014; Jordan et al., 2016; Luce-Kapler & Walsh, 1996; Richardson & Walsh, 2018; Snowber & Bickel, 2015; Walsh, 2018; Walsh & Bai, 2015, 2017; Walsh, Bickel, & Leggo, 2015; Walsh, Brigham, & Women Diversity and Teaching Group, 2007; Walsh, Gonzalez, Joy, & MacAulay, 2014; Women Writing Women Collective, 2014).

what wants to emerge today? staying in the moment with each other a gift to be in a new fresh moment

teaching the summer course I was in such a contemplative focused space for/with the students my self in relations the *I* and the *we* and the *it* of the experience

> this day meeting in the space of the moon eclipse moon energy moon insights spirit world attunement cosmos/celestial surrender fully receiving ourselves

a hovering doorway stretch and loss we over extended our capacity what feels like it wants to emerge today? profound gratitude and love and tiredness old wounds what wants to step forward be acknowledged in this space today? flame of the candle smell of sage my body heavy and light ready and also not ready

the breath the healing scent of sage its power to purify remove obstacles the presence of the moon approach of the lunar new year voices chanting together

taking my seat feeling my power as a mother female warrior writer artist someone who communicates with the spirit world holding my seat with dignity surrender receiving opening the heart trust in life energy a baby teacher

waterpaint blue baby water fluid surrender to spirit realm trust receiving whatever arises middle spiral painting with my fingers water paint on my hands a peaceful baby content breathing trust relaxing with life energy healing watery blue



Figure 7. Receiving, opening, surrendering. Photo: S. Walsh.

148 Walsh/Bickel, "THE GIFT OF WIT(H)NESSING TRANSITIONAL MOMENTS"

hovering at doorways being stretched thin also stretching swirling students changing landscapes loss grief small pieces of nourishment with others

> what wants to emerge today? working to stay in the moment with each other a gift to be in a new fresh moment with another

what do *we* need today? deep wounds of inadequacy arise want to be acknowledged holding in sometimes watching as in a dream what do we need? a thin wispy trail of sweetgrass smoke in the air healing opening to the space-between resting in the space-between with confidence candles burning across space-time



Figure 8. Susan in prayer. Photo: B. Bickel.

what do *we* need? connected in the electromagnetic field of the internet and zoom waiting for Susan to accept my invitation I go to the kitchen make tea walk back to my desk and she is there she dropped into my house a sensory hit floods me "oh Susan has arrived from next door, coming through my open door"

we invite Carl into our co-inquiry in spirit form having left this world his energy still vibrating in the electromagnetic fields interconnecting with our we Carl, the third editor of our course textbook³ now present in our third co-inquiry a meeting of three a solid base a strong triangular foundation we have heart

we invite Carl in to the space his openness willingness to follow energy be vulnerable the unconditional love he represents to so many



Figure 9. Visual reflections on the journey home. Photo: B. Bickel.

3 Carl Leggo co-edited *Arts-Based and Contemplative Practices in Research and Teaching; Honoring Presence*, with Barbara and Susan (Walsh, Bickel, & Leggo, 2015) and co-facilitated a retreat with them for the Arts Researchers and Teachers Society (ARTS) preconference event in advance of the Canadian Society for the Study of Education (CSSE) conference in 2017. Carl passed from his life on earth in March 2019 while we worked on this article.

re-reading my final writing to students so grateful this is a pass fail model and I do not have to assign grades to what is unmarkable dwelling with vivid memories of the course on the 10 hour drive home sitting in my backyard writing wi(t)hness consciousness I was in such a contemplative focused space for/with them similar to the co-inquiry space with Susan now I feel relief to be in the conjoined I and we of co-shared living learning experiences reflecting each other

What is the Gift Created by our Stitching?

As we reflect on wit(h)nessing our transitional spaces through this co-inquiry, we acknowledge too the threads of our labour over many years in the academy: the ways we have arrived as women artists in this space-time, this now. The electromagnetic fields transmuted through our computers create a shared healing space for our weary spirits, offering a mutual restorative and reflexive lacuna. Through the co-writing process and the co-wit(h)nessing experience in real-time-writing we walk through the passageway of a hovering door together. The passageway marks a farewell—a leave-taking. In that leave-taking we leave behind part of ourselves and carry forward with us many gifts. Collegially imbued gifts that we have stitched into and will continue to stitch into. In our transitional passage that this co-inquiry has honoured and cared for, we deeply recognize the gift as a living entity still alive and being passed on and shared forward by many in the academy.

In the process of our co-writing discussions, those that have gifted us have shone through. In our still recovering and overextended lives, we gift each other with remembering; remembering the gift of teaching and learning has not been completely usurped by the scarcity-based neoliberal exchange economy. The 21st century academy has been compromised and beaten down but it is still gifting-circulating and extending itself through us and others. The blanket we have stitched in this contemplative arts co-inquiry holds us and others and the academy in its embrace. Its stitches re-tell omitted lines of the story, holds the wisdom of restoring the powerful interrelationships between art, contemplation, research, teaching and learning that challenges the perceived risk often engendered by such connections in the academy and other settings, while also highlighting the value of arts practices in holistic education. Our commitment to contemplative arts inquiry practices have led us toward a greater sense of connectedness in our lives, to one another, to nature, and the cosmos. Strengthening education's potential for restorative and transformative experiences in the classroom, community, and world is the gift that we have been returned to through writing wit(h)ness consciousness with each other in this contemplative arts co-inquiry.

References

- Bai, H., & Scott, C. (2011). The primacy of consciousness in philosophy: A role for contemplative practices in education. *Korean Journal of Philosophy of Education*, 33(4), 129–145.
- Bai, H., Scott, C., & Donald, B. (2009). Contemplative pedagogy and revitalization of teacher education. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research*, 55(3), 319–334.
- Bhattacharya, K., & Payne, R. (2016). Mixing mediums, mixing selves: Arts-based contemplative approaches to border crossings. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 29(9), 1100–1117. https://doi.org/10.1080/09518398.2016. 1201163
- Bickel, B., & Hugill, T. (2011). Re/turning to her: An a/r/tographic ritual inquiry. Visual Culture and Gender, 6(1), 6–12. https://vcg.emitto.net/index.php/vcg/article/ view/54/56
- Bickel, B., & Sims, M. (2014). Making eye contact: Mary Beth Edelson's performance art as public pedagogy. *Journal of Arts and Community*, 5(1), 41–53. https://doi.org/10.1386/ jaac.5.1.41_1
- Bickel, B., & Gu, X. with Irwin, I., Beer, R., & Grauer, K. (2015). Resistance and intervention through a radical ethical aesthetic: The art of Gu Xiong. *Visual Inquiry*, 4(2), 97–109. https://doi.org/10.1386/vi.4.2.97_1
- Bickel, B., with Wendt, G. [Video]. (2015). Socially engaged art education beyond the classroom: Napping, dreaming, and art making. *Artizein: Arts and Teaching Journal*, 1(1),79–91.https://opensiuc.lib.siu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1027&context=atj
- Bickel, B., Jordan, N., Rose, I., McConachy, M., & Griffith, C. L. (2018). Communal dreaming: Enlarging the space of the possible through a postmodern curriculum of Nap-Ins. In M. Garbutt & N. Roenpagel (Eds.) & A. Rourke & V. Rees (Series Curators), *The mindful eye: Contemplative pedagogies in visual arts education. Transformative pedagogies in the visual domain: Book No. 3* (pp. 117–149). Common Ground Research Networks.
- Binder, M. (2016). Spirituality and the arts: Interwoven landscapes of identity and meaning. In M. de Souza, J. Bone, & J. Watson (Eds.), *Spirituality across disciplines: Research and practice* (pp. 285–297). Springer International.
- Brown, J. (2001). Dakini's warm breath: The feminine principle in Tibetan Buddhism. Shambhala.
- Cixous, H. (1993). *Three steps on the ladder of writing* (S. Cornell & S. Sellers, Trans.). Columbia University Press.
- Cixous, H. (1997). The laugh of the Medusa. In R. R. Warhol, & D. P. Herndl (Eds.), *Feminisms: An anthology of literary theory and criticism* (pp. 347–362). Rutgers University Press.
- CORE (Collaborators on Research in Education: Brigham, Forrest, Leighteizer, Walsh). (2006). Writing co-respondents: Teacher educators reflect on 'orienting' new students. *Journal of the Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies (JCACS)*, 4(2), 21–38. http://pi.library.yorku.ca/ojs/index.php/jcacs/article/viewFile/17003/15805
- Counternormativity Discourse Group (Filax, Walsh, Sumara, Davis). (2005). Performing an archive of feeling: Experiences of normalizing structures in teaching and teacher

education. Journal of Curriculum and Pedagogy, 2(2), 173–214. https://doi.org/10.1080/15505170.2005.10411565

- Eppert, C., Vokey, D., Nguyen, T., & Bai, H. (2015). Intercultural philosophy and the nondual wisdom of 'Basic Goodness': Implications for contemplative and transformative education. *Journal of Philosophy of Education*, 49(2), 274–293. https:// doi.org/10.1111/1467-9752.12141
- Eppert, C., & Wang, H. (Eds.). (2008). Cross-cultural studies in curriculum: Eastern thought, educational insights. Routledge.
- Ettinger, B. (1999). Traumatic wit(h)ness-thing and matrixial co-in-habit(u)ating. *Parallax*, 5(1), 89–98. https://doi.org/10.1080/135346499249911
- Ettinger, B. (2014). "The world is gone, I must carry you": Daring the shock of emun (trust), on the transjective subreal in art and psychoanalysis. Summer School of Sexualities, Culture and Politics course. Research Center for Cultures, Politics and Identities (IPAV Center). Faculty of Media and Communications. Serbia; Singidunum University. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=A3hbixTlncU
- Fernandes, L. (2003). Transforming feminist practice: Non-violence, social justice and the possibilities of a spiritualized feminism. Aunt Lute Books.
- Fisher, R. M. (2017). *The aesthetic fusion of color and light* (G. Wendt, videographer). https:// vimeo.com/220708479
- Fisher, R. M., & Bickel, B. (2015). Aesthetic wit(h)nessing within a matrixial paradigm. Guest editors Boyd White & Tracy Constantino. *Canadian Review of Art Education: Research and Issues*, 42(1), 76–95.
- Franklin, M. A. (2017). Art as contemplative practice: Expressive pathways to self. SUNY.
- Gablik, S. (1992). Connective aesthetics. American Art, 6(2), 2-7. https:// www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/pdfplus/10.1086/424147?casa_ token=wjJ0Xawr9FIAAAAA:Rf4XPcG3_afscFkSb-bMMPfdmsY4UIS1-F0rjnfPvSVENZzuvi1rFf71B2KBUt_owX0_uuP2Vg
- Gannon, S., Walsh, S., Byers, M., & Rajiva, M. (2014). Deterritorializing collective biography. International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education, 27(2), 181–195. https://doi.or g/10.1080/09518398.2012.737044
- Gradle, S. (2006). Developing artistry in teaching: Ritual, art and human concerns. Art Education: The Journal of the National Art Education Association, 59(2), 12–19. https:// doi.org/10.1080/00043125.2006.11651582
- Gradle, S., & Bickel, B. (2010). The unfolding inner teacher: Applying holistic ideas from Beittel & Schaefer-Simmern. *Journal of the American Association for the Advancement of Curriculum Studies*, 6(1), 1–18. https://doi.org/10.14288/jaaacs.v6i1.187689
- Gunnlagson, O., Scott, C., Bai, H., & Sarath, E. (2017). *The intersubjective turn: Theoretical approaches to Contemplative learning and inquiry across disciplines.* SUNY Press.
- Hyde, L. (2007). The gift: Creativity and the artist in the modern world. Vintage Books.
- Irwin, R., Bickel, B., Triggs, V., Springgay, S., Beer, R., Grauer, K., Gu, X., & Sameshima, P. (2009). The city of Richgate: A/r/tographic cartography as public pedagogy. *International Journal of Art and Design Education*, 28(1), 61–70. https://doi. org/10.1111/j.1476-8070.2009.01593.x
- Irwin, R. L., & de Cosson, A. (Eds.). (2004). *A/r/t/ography: Rendering self through arts-based living inquiry*. Pacific Educational Press.

- Jordan, N. (2013). Goddess Puja in California: Embodying contemplation through women's spirituality education. *Paideusis*, 21(1), 13–25.
- Jordan, N., Richardson, P., Fisher, M., Bickel, B., & Walsh, S. (2016). Provoking curricula of care: Weaving stories of rupture towards repair. Journal of the Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies (JCACS), Special Issue, Canadian Curriculum Studies: A Métissage of Inspiration/Imagination/Interconnection, 14(1), 33–54. https://jcacs.journals.yorku. ca/index.php/jcacs/article/view/40299/36184
- Kelly, V. (2015). To see, to know, to shape, to show: The path of an Indigenous artist. In S. Walsh, B. Bickel, & C. Leggo (Eds.), Arts-based and contemplative practices in research and teaching: Honoring presence (pp. 46–65). Routledge.
- Klein, A. C. (1995). *Meeting the Great Bliss Queen: Buddhists, feminists, and the art of the self.* Beacon Press.
- Kumar, A. (2013). Curriculum as meditative inquiry. Palgrave MacMillan.
- Lange, E. (2004). Transformative and restorative learning: A vital dialectic for sustainable societies. Adult Education Quarterly, 54(2), 121–139. https://doi. org/10.1177/0741713603260276
- Luce-Kapler, R., & Walsh, S. (1996). Holographing the page. JCT: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Curriculum Studies, 12(2), 19–27.
- Mattis-Namgyel, E. (2010). The power of an open question. Shambhala.
- Miller, J. (2013). *The contemplative practitioner: Meditation in education and the workplace* (2nd ed.). University of Toronto Press.
- Neilsen, A. (2004). Provoked by astonishment: Seeing and understanding in inquiry. In A. Cole, L. Neilsen, J. G. Knowles, & T. Luciani, *Provoked by art: Theorizing arts-informed research* (pp. 52–61). Backalong Books and Centre for Arts-informed Research.
- Palmer, P., Zajonc, A., & Scribner, M. (2010). *The heart of higher education: A call to renewal*. Jossey-Bass.
- Richardson, P., & Walsh, S. (2018). Endless open heart: Collaborative poetry and image as contemplative and restorative practice / Du fond du cœur: Poésie concertée et imagerie pour une pratique contemplative et restauratrice. Canadian Review of Art Education: Research and Issues / Revue Canadienne de Recherches et Enjeux en Education Artistique, 45(1), 153–164. http://crae.mcgill.ca/issue/view/6
- Seidel, J., & Jardine, D. (2014). Ecological pedagogy, Buddhist pedagogy, hermeneutic pedagogy: Experiments in a curriculum for miracles. Peter Lang.
- Smith, D. G. (2014). Teaching as the practice of wisdom. Bloomsbury Academic.
- Snowber, C. (2016). *Embodied inquiry: Writing, living and being through the body.* Sense Publishers.
- Snowber, C., & Bickel, B. (2015). Companions with mystery: Art, spirit and the ecstatic. In S. Walsh, C. Leggo, & B. Bickel (Eds.) Arts-based and contemplative practices in research and teaching: Honoring presence (pp. 67–87). Routledge.
- Starhawk. (1989). The spiral dance: A rebirth of the ancient religion of the Great Goddess. Harper San Francisco.
- Walsh, S. (2018). Contemplative and artful openings: Researching women and teaching. Routledge.
- Walsh, S., & Bai, H. (2015). Writing witness consciousness. In S. Walsh, B. Bickel, & C. Leggo (Eds.), Arts-based and contemplative practices in research and teaching: Honoring presence (pp. 24–44). Routledge.

- Walsh, S., & Bai, H. (2017). Writing the cauldron as intersubjective practice. In O. Gunnlaugson, C. Scott, H. Bai, & E. Sarath (Eds.), *The intersubjective turn: Theoretical approaches to contemplative learning and inquiry across disciplines* (pp. 249–266). State University of New York Press.
- Walsh, S., Bickel, B., & Leggo, C. (Eds.). (2015). Arts-based and contemplative practices in research and teaching: Honoring presence. Routledge.
- Walsh, S., Brigham, S., & the Women, Diversity, and Teaching Group. (2007). Internationally educated female teachers who have immigrated to Nova Scotia: A research/ performance text. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 6(3), 1–28. https://doi. org/10.1177/160940690700600301
- Walsh, S., Gonzalez, F., Joy, P., & MacAulay, K. (2014). "But are we going to deal with the hard questions?" Waves of compassion in Halifax Regional Municipality. *Paideusis: Canadian Journal of Philosophy of Education Society*, 21(2), 55–70. https://journals.sfu. ca/pie/index.php/pie/article/view/375
- Women Writing Women Collective (Armstrong, Bickel, Fels, Gerhard, Hoy, Jordan, Nielsen, Smith, Stubbs, Triggs). (2014). Learning wisdom through collectivity: *The Women Writing Women Collective. Women in Higher Education*, 7(1),1–18. https://doi. org/10.1515/njawhe-2014-0002
- Zajonc, A. (2003). Spirituality in higher education: Overcoming the divide. *Liberal education*, *89*(1), 50–58.
- Zajonc, A. (2009). *Meditation as contemplative inquiry: When knowing becomes love.* Lindisfarne Books.