

Volume 33 Issue 2

cjsae

the canadian journal for the study of adult education

la revue canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes

rceéa

TAKING STOCK OF RESEARCH ON IMMIGRATION
AND ADULT EDUCATION IN CANADA: 1981–2020

Shibao Guo and Jingzhou (Jo) Liu

*The Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education/
La revue canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes*
Editor-in-Chief: Robert Mizzi
www.cjsae-rceea.ca

33,2 November/novembre 2021, 135–155
ISSN1925-993X (online)

© Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education/
L'Association canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes
www.casae-aceea.ca

TAKING STOCK OF RESEARCH ON IMMIGRATION AND ADULT EDUCATION IN CANADA: 1981–2020

Shibao Guo

University of Calgary

Jingzhou (Jo) Liu

University of Calgary

Abstract

This article takes stock of research on immigration and adult education in Canada from 1981 to 2020. Through summative content analysis, we analyze the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education's annual conference proceedings to examine how Canadian adult educators have taken up these topics in their research over the past 40 years. Drawing on intersectionality theory, the analysis focuses on how race, gender, class, and sexual orientation intersect to shape the experiences of adult immigrant learners in producing social inequality. The findings reveal that although Canadian adult educators have progressively adopted an intersectional approach to the study of immigrant experiences in Canada, this shift is insufficient for building inclusive learning spaces that are capable of assisting marginalized immigrants in overcoming multifaceted challenges in the host society. In light of this, we propose an integrative intersectional framework that goes beyond the existing triple analysis embracing racialized immigrants as actors and agents of change with reference to the specifics of everyday reality through the struggle for identity and social equality. This approach also allows adult educators to examine the internal and external layers of complexity between social categories and structural power, constructing a more integrative landscape to capture social and power relations.

Résumé

Cet article explore les recherches sur l'immigration et l'éducation des adultes au Canada entre 1981 et 2020. Cette analyse de contenu sommative examine les actes du congrès annuel de l'Association canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes pour tracer le traitement de ces sujets dans quarante ans de recherches en éducation des adultes au Canada. En mobilisant la théorie intersectionnelle, l'analyse aborde comment l'intersection de la race, du genre, de la classe et de l'orientation sexuelle façonne les expériences des personnes immigrantes apprenantes en produisant des inégalités sociales. Les résultats indiquent que même si le monde de l'éducation

*The Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education/
La revue canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes
33,2 November/novembre 2021, 135–155
ISSN1925-993X (online)*

© Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education/
L'Association canadienne pour l'étude de l'éducation des adultes

des adultes adopte progressivement une approche intersectionnelle pour étudier les expériences immigrantes au Canada, ce virage est insuffisant pour créer des espaces d'apprentissage inclusifs qui aident les personnes immigrantes marginalisées à surmonter les défis multidimensionnels dans la société d'accueil. Nous proposons un cadre intersectionnel intégratif qui dépasse l'analyse tripartite où les personnes immigrantes racisées sont des agentes et catalyseurs du changement en citant les spécificités de la réalité quotidienne de la lutte pour l'identité et l'égalité sociale.

Canada's history since its birth as a nation in 1867 is one of immigration, nation building, and contested racial and ethnic relations (Guo & Wong, 2018). Reflecting on Canada's immigration, racial, and ethnic studies from Confederation to the 1960s, Guo and Wong (2018) maintained that Canada adopted blatant ethnocentric and racist immigration policies to keep out the "undesirable" and "unassimilable" citizens. The 1967 points system established universalistic criteria that shifted the selection of immigrants to human capital in determining the potential eligibility of people wanting to immigrate to Canada. Guo and Wong argued that despite Canada's claimed non-racist immigration policies, racial and ethnic conflict and division have persisted over the past century and a half as manifested in racialized divisions between Whiteness and non-Whiteness and between the foreign-born and the native-born. Racialized peoples within Canada experience racism and ethnic discrimination socially in their everyday lives, in the educational system, in the labour force, and in the legal scheme as anti-Asian and anti-Black racism were systemic, along with anti-Semitism. According to Guo and Wong, microaggressions motivated by race, ethnicity, and religion are fairly prevalent in Canada. There has also been a significant rise of reported hate crimes perpetrated against Muslims in Canada in the last two decades since 9/11. More recently, since the outbreak of COVID-19, there has been a surge in racism and xenophobia across the country toward Asian Canadians, particularly those of Chinese descent (Guo & Guo, 2021).

Besides immigration, another important part of Canada's history relates to the founding of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education (CASAE). Since its inception in 1981, CASAE has not merely played an essential role in promoting adult education as a field of study in different contexts, but also engaged actively in advocating for positive social change. An early example of Canadian adult education for social change is the Antigonish Movement, led by Moses Coady and Jimmy Tompkins, which established study clubs, credit unions, and co-operatives to address poor employment conditions and other economic concerns among working-class miners, steelworkers, and fishermen (Welton, 2001). Equally important to the movement were the contributions of women who promoted co-operatives and adult learning through activities such as establishing libraries and study clubs (Neal, 1998). Since then, Canadian adult education continues to serve the needs of marginalized adult learners such as workers, farmers, and women. As Canada's population is becoming more diverse as a result of growing immigration, however, Canadian adult education faces unprecedented new challenges in meeting the needs of an increasingly ethnoculturally diverse student population. In this regard, it is not clear to what extent Canadian adult education has upheld its progressive roots in creating socially just and inclusive education environments for adult immigrants. In celebrating CASAE's 40th anniversary, it is therefore necessary to take stock of research on immigration and adult education in Canada from 1981 to 2020 to examine how Canadian adult educators have

taken up these topics in their research over the past 40 years. It is hoped that the findings will inform us about our past research and practices and provide new directions for the future of Canadian adult education.

The discussion that follows is organized in four parts. It begins with an overview of the theoretical framework that is informed by intersectionality theory, followed by a discussion of our research design and data collection. The third part reports findings of our study, and we end with a discussion and conclusion.

Theoretical Framework

Intersectionality theory provides an effective theoretical framework for this study. Intersectionality can be defined as "a way of understanding and analyzing the complexity in the world, in people, and in human experiences" (Collins & Bilge, 2016, p. 2). It focuses on gender, race, and class as distinct social categories of multiple identities that are mutually constituted to shape people's experience in producing social inequality (Collins & Bilge, 2016). The term was initially coined in the late 1980s and early 1990s by African American law professor Kimberlé Crenshaw, underscoring how intersectional identities shaped African American women in their employment experiences and marginalized them to become vulnerable in both analysis and politics (Crenshaw, 1989, 1991). In her initial formulation of intersectionality, Crenshaw examined how intersections of race and gender shaped Black women's employment experiences and marginalized vulnerable individuals and communities in both analysis and politics (Crenshaw, 1989). Through her analysis of domestic violence and rape against Black women, Crenshaw (1991) found that their experiences consist of a combination of both racism and sexism that cannot be understood in independent terms of either being Black or a woman. In light of these findings, Crenshaw proposed intersectionality as a strategy to capture how social identities of race and gender are interrelated with practice, experience, and politics and how these identities are grounded and constructed in the social world. In subsequent works, she argued that racialized experiences of women of colour cannot be interpreted analytically without also including the embodiment of class (Crenshaw, 1993). Commenting on Crenshaw's contributions, Collins and Bilge (2016) claimed that her work marked an important transitional moment within intersectionality's history.

Collins and Bilge (2016) highlighted six core ideas of intersectionality, including social inequality, power, relationality, social context, complexity, and social justice. They pointed out that intersectionality as an analytic tool encourages us to move beyond seeing social inequality through race-only or class-only lenses and instead treating it as intersectional categories. Power, situated in the global context of capitalism, nationalism, and neo-liberalism, stratifies superiority and subordination to global social inequality. This hierarchy extensively shapes people's experiences and identities, which simultaneously "constitute interlocking, mutually constructing or intersecting systems of power" (p. 27). Power relations, Collins and Bilge argued, are to be analyzed both via their intersections (e.g., of racism and sexism) as well as across domains of power (i.e., structural, disciplinary, cultural, and interpersonal). Furthermore, relational thinking rejects either/or binary thinking, and instead embraces a both/and frame. The intersectionality framework encourages understanding how class, race, and gender collectively shape global social inequality. In this view, social context is particularly important because intersectionality

underscores the significance of contextualizing one's arguments in specific historical and political contexts. Collins and Bilge further argued that social inequality, power, relationality, and social context are intertwined, introducing an element of complexity into intersectional analysis. Finally, social justice is critical because it extends the circle of intersectionality to include people who use intersectionality as an analytic tool for social justice. Overall, each of these core ideas interact with one another, collectively contributing to intersectionality's complexity.

Crenshaw's pioneering work has created focal spaces for studies that address intersectional identities and their interconnections and intersections between multidimensional social constructions. McCall (2005) produced a typology of three intersectional approaches to deconstructing the complexity and capacity of social life and events: intracategorical, intercategorical, and antecategorical. Respectively, they represent three defining aspects of intersectionality: inclusion and voice, analytical interactions, and institutional primacy. The intracategorical group-centred approach underlines the importance of giving voice to particular social groups that are underrepresented and situated in complex and oppressed social contexts. Since single-axis analysis fails to account for the multiplicity of subordinate positions, there is an essential need to add intersectional relations to what are typically conceptualized as persistent, untransformed main effects (McCall, 2005). As a process-centred approach focusing on intersectionality as an analytic interaction, the intercategorical approach explores multiple structures and variations in the intersections of individual identities and highlights context and comparison at the intersections to reveal the structural processes that organize power. This approach uses existing analytical categories strategically and temporarily to understand an effect of structural inequality, exploring "relationships of inequality among social groups and changing configurations of inequality along multiple and conflicting dimensions" (McCall, 2005, p. 1773). Another intersectional analytical approach, which McCall (2005) called antecategorical, is a system-centred model that views social life as complex and fluid and incomprehensible if viewed only through the lenses of existing analytical categories. The antecategorical approach challenges the formation of hegemonic social groups and invites researchers to reconsider social categories of difference and avoid sectioning lived experiences into differing social identities such as race, gender, class, or sexual orientation (Kaushik & Walsh, 2018). More importantly, this approach discourages analyses that associate specific inequalities with unique institutions. Instead, it looks for processes that are "fully interactive, historically co-determining, and complex" (Choo & Ferree, 2010, p. 129).

Over the past two decades, intersectionality has become one of the most influential frameworks in such disciplines as feminist studies, ethnic studies, and legal studies, as well as in the fields of sociology, history, literature, philosophy, and anthropology (Cho et al., 2013). In relation to immigration, empirical studies have called attention to how intersectionality can be developed, adopted, and adapted within studies of diverse migration groups. For example, Viruell-Fuentes et al. (2012) noted a theoretical shift from cultural acculturation to an intersectional approach in studies of immigrant health outcomes, and they identified how multiple dimensions of structural disparity—such as racialization processes, discrimination, residential segregation, and immigration policies, along with gender and class—impact the sustainability of immigrants' well-being. In studies of immigrant women, Chun et al. (2013) investigated the intersectional inequality of Asian American women, indicating that disempowerment is entrenched in different dimensions of embodied identities, personal

history, and the mechanism of gender, pervading how inequalities are conceived, processed, and retained. In the Canadian context, Fuller and Vosko (2008) argued that social locations of gender, race, and immigrant status intersect in the oppression of temporary migrant workers. They stressed the importance of understanding the axes of social location through an intersectional lens to explore the relationships between social location and other factors in employment oppression rather than treating them as homogeneous.

The aforementioned studies underscored the wide and interdisciplinary application of intersectional frameworks, especially in feminist and anti-racist scholarship, in which the analytical focus has shifted from deliberate privilege and prejudice to systemic stratification and institutional power (Chun et al., 2013; Kaushik & Walsh, 2018; Liu, 2019a). As such, recent applications of intersectionality have eclipsed earlier studies focusing on "the big three": triple oppression, triple jeopardy, or the holy trinity of race, gender, and class (Lewis, 2009). The ways in which intersectionality is being theorized and applied are evolving beyond its original tenets; it has become a conceptually flexible framework for understanding the complexity of intersectional identities within broader discourses of social, cultural, political, and economic marginalization and segregation. Despite such claims, critics argued that this framework has not engaged issues of sexuality, or it has been theoretically understood as a heteronormative concept that elides the issue of sexuality (Cho, 2013; Mizzi, 2016). As such, the neglect limits the capacity of intersectionality to grapple with subjects who inhabit multiple social locations and those with privileged identities. The sexuality critique of intersectionality suggests post-intersectionality approaches that go beyond the normal "silos" to include sexuality and other subordinating categories. It is with this flexibility in mind that we examine studies in immigration and adult education over the past 40 years with a goal to move beyond the triple analysis.

Research Design and Data Collection

This study adopts a summative content analysis of the literature as its research method. Summative content analysis is an unobtrusive and nonreactive method that involves "counting and comparisons, usually of keywords or content, followed by the interpretation of the underlying context" (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005, p. 1277). Summative content analysis is a flexible content analysis method for analyzing textual data to identify core consistencies and meanings (Patton, 2014). It follows a sequential approach, moving from the discovery and analysis of certain categories or themes to addressing how those categories or themes relate to contextualized interpretation and discussion. Summative content analysis also allows researchers to move beyond the counting of keywords to the discovery and interpretation of the meanings of alternative terms or phrases throughout the research process (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005). Therefore, summative content analysis accentuates the interrelations between particular content and how contextual meanings respond to specific terms in narratives.

In taking stock of research on immigration and adult education in Canada over the past 40 years, we analyzed CASAE conference proceedings published from 1981 to 2020, including paper presentations, roundtables, symposia, and posters. While reviewing these proceedings, we paid special attention to how adult education research in these proceedings had addressed issues pertinent to immigration with a focus on the intersections of race, gender, and class. It needs to be noted that the field of adult education encompasses broad

areas of work and learning, community development, labour studies and engagement, literacy and education, mental health education, and language education. In the selected sample, we included studies on immigration in the Canadian context as well as all studies in which immigrants participating in the research addressed their intersectional identities and lived experiences. First, we developed a set of criteria by which to review papers that focused on immigration, migration, transnational migration, temporary foreign workers, refugees, visible minorities, immigrant women, immigrant youth, LGBTQ immigrants, immigrant professionals, foreign credential recognition, Language Instruction for Newcomers to Canada (LINC), immigrant integration, immigrant identity, immigrant service organizations, transnationalism, multiculturalism, anti-racism, racialization, and cultural diversity. Then we conducted a search for these keywords in the titles and abstracts of the papers. After selecting the papers that made up the sample, we carefully reviewed the interactive, reflective, and reiterative nature of the sample studies and engaged not only with their relationship to intersectionality, the context of immigration, and adult education, but also with their interrelations, constantly summarizing and comparing in order to move beyond fixed terms and numerical counts of the occurrences of particular words or phrases, explore the interrelations among the coding, and examine how they emerged in the converging patterns and discourses. Therefore, in analyzing the proceedings papers, we focused on the purpose and research questions of the study, theoretical traditions, methodological approaches, research findings, and implications. Both hard copies and electronic proceedings were used in this analysis. Of note, CASAE held five joint conferences with its international counterparts, particularly the American Adult Education Research Conference (AERC), since 2000. We included those conferences but mainly focused on the Canadian papers published in the joint proceedings.

Report of Findings

Mapping Research on Immigration

Despite Canada's rich history of immigration and its long tradition of serving marginalized adult learners, a review of the conference proceedings from 1981 to 2020 reveals that there was a lack of interest in this topic. It was not until the new millennium, when Canadian scholars (Mojab et al., 2000) organized the first roundtable at the joint CASAE and AERC conference in Vancouver, that immigration and its interrelations with adult education were addressed by the adult education community. Prior to that, only one paper dealing with immigrants and adult education, by Alok Mukherjee and Elaine Copper (1987), was presented at the sixth annual CASAE conference held at McMaster University in 1987. The paper, entitled "Race Relations Training for School Administrators and Employees: An Adult Education Model," examined race relations training at the Toronto Board of Education for senior managers and racial minority employees. This training attempted to apply principles of adult education to program design and drew on the concrete experience of the participants. From 1988 to 1999, nothing else was found in relation to this topic. Thus, the focus of our research is mainly on the last half of CASAE's 40 years, 2000 to 2020.

Out of the 1,806 papers, roundtables, symposia, and posters published in CASAE proceedings from 2000 to 2020, 134 (7.4%) addressed immigration-related topics. To be more specific, 1,425 conference papers and 253 roundtables were published from 2000 to 2020, and of those, only 105 papers (7.4%) and 17 roundtables (6.7%) related

to immigration topics. With respect to symposia, 65 were organized during the past 20 years, with only eight (12.3%) focused on immigration. If we divide the last 20 years into two decades, then from 2000 to 2010 only 5.6% of paper presentations, 5.2% of roundtables, and zero symposia discussed immigration issues. However, in the decade since 2011, there was growing attention to immigration studies: 9% of paper presentations, 5.2% of roundtables, 25.8% of symposia, and 4.7% of posters focused on immigration research in the CASAE proceedings. Another interesting finding is that the number of presentations on immigration tended to be lower when joint conferences were held in Canada, with four out of five years below the average of 7.4%. This is likely because of how competitive it is to have proposals accepted at joint conferences. Overall, it appears evident that immigration-related studies were underrepresented.

Breaking this down further by year, we found that the number of presentations varies significantly from year to year (see Table 1). Following the first roundtable in 2000, things were quite slow until 2005, when seven papers were presented in one year, accounting for 13.5% of the total number of presentations that year. The highest number of presentations was in 2017, with 13 out of 88 presentations, representing 14.8% of the total presentations in that year. Although the percentages are slowly increasing, the attention to immigration in the context of adult education remains inadequate. There is evidence suggesting that Canadian adult educators have been actively involved in providing education to adult immigrants throughout Canadian history. As Selman et al. (1998) noted, "The education of immigrants has been a constant pre-occupation of Canadian society, including adult education" (p. 43); this is also true dating back to Frontier College promoting literacy and citizenship among male immigrant labourers on the Canadian frontier in the late 19th century, unfortunately for the construction of imagined national community (Walter, 2003). It is not clear, however, why adult educators were not paying enough attention to issues concerning immigration when Canada has increased its intake of immigrants. Could this lacuna be the result of adult educators primarily seeing themselves as practitioners and the study of social issues concerning immigration as a topic for sociologists?

The Changing Landscape of Research on Immigration

Despite the low numbers of immigration-related publications in the CASAE proceedings, topics encompassed a wide variety, including immigrant settlement and integration, citizenship, employment, immigrant women, immigrant community organizations, anti-racist education, health education, youth development and education, refugee resettlement, foreign credential recognition, volunteering and informal learning, and English as a second language. The proceedings clearly reveal that recent immigrants in Canada face a series of challenges related to their integration as well as internal and external power structures and relations. For example, Guo (2013a, 2013b) used the term *the triple glass effect* to illustrate the multiple layers of structural barriers facing immigrant professionals in Canada as a result of devaluation of their prior learning and work experiences, including a glass gate, a glass door, and a glass ceiling. While a glass gate denies immigrants' entrance to guarded professional communities, a glass door blocks immigrants' access to professional employment at high-wage firms. Finally, the glass ceiling prevents immigrants from moving into management positions because of their ethnic and

Table 1. Immigration-Related Publications in CASAE Proceedings, 2000–2010

Year	Papers		Roundtables		Symposia		Posters		Posters		% of Total
	Total (No.)	Related (No.)	Total (No.)	Related (No.)	Total (No.)	Related (No.)	Total (No.)	Related (No.)	Total (No.)		
2000*	99	-	32	1	5	-			136	1	0.7%
2001	37	-	-	-	-	-			37	0	0.0%
2002	57	-	10	1	7	-			74	1	1.4%
2003	43	1	6	-	1	-			50	1	2.0%
2004*	90	3	14	-	3	-			107	3	2.8%
2005	44	7	6	-	2	-			52	7	13.5%
2006	42	5	10	1	3	-			55	6	10.9%
2007*	113	3	24	1	5	-			142	4	2.8%
2008	59	9	10	1	2	-			71	10	14.1%
2009	43	5	10	-	3	-			56	5	8.9%
2010	65	6	13	2	3	-			81	8	9.9%
2011*	112	5	18	1	4	2	-	-	134	8	6.0%
2012	51	6	11	2	3	-	12	-	77	8	10.4%
2013	92	8	14	1	4	-	-	-	110	9	8.2%
2014	61	4	4	-	4	-	9	1	78	5	6.4%
2015	74	4	9	1	4	1	14	-	101	6	5.9%
2016	53	8	21	2	1	-	7	-	82	10	12.2%
2017	63	11	20	-	3	1	2	1	88	13	14.8%
2018	44	5	13	1	-	-	7	-	64	6	9.4%
2019	78	9	8	2	3	1	9	-	98	13	13.3%
2020*	105	6	-	-	5	3	3	1	113	10	8.8%
Total	1425	105	253	17	65	8	63	3	1806	134	7.4%

*Joint conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education and Adult Education Research Conference.

*Joint conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education, Adult Education Research Conference, Adult Learning Australia, American Association for Adult and Continuing Education, European Society for Research in the Education of Adults, Indian Adult Education Association, International Society for Comparative Adult Education, and Standing Conference on University Teaching and Research in the Education of Adults. This conference was postponed to 2021 due to COVID-19. However, conference proceedings of the accepted proposals were published.

cultural differences. The glass gate, glass door, and glass ceiling may converge to create multiple structural barriers and affect immigrants' new working lives at different stages of their integration and transition processes.

Researchers drew from a rich diversity of theoretical frameworks in their analyses, such as anti-racist theory, critical theory, feminist pedagogy, Marxist perspectives, and post-colonial theory. Methodologically, most studies adopted qualitative research approaches, including case studies, narrative inquiry, life history, arts-based research methodologies, critical discourse analysis, institutional ethnography, and participatory action research. For example, when arts-based methods were first adopted in 2005 by Walsh and Brigham (2005) on immigrant women's learning trajectories, our analysis shows that a growing number of studies progressively adopted arts-based methodologies to explore the experiences of racialized immigrant social groups, including refugee youths, immigrant women, and internationally educated teachers. Adult educators who have adopted an arts-based method, including Shauna Butterwick, Susan M. Brigham, Darlene Clover, and Shahrzad Mojab, have demonstrated how an arts-based methodology can enrich the exploration of cultural, social, and contextual situatedness, and how such artistic actions as making and sharing contributed to collective knowledge reconstruction. Moreover, these studies also used institutional ethnography to understand immigrants' experiences of work and learning. Shan (2008), in particular, argued that immigrants' choice of retraining is constituted through a complex of social and institutional relations that attribute differential values to education acquired at different local sites. Liu (2019b) also found that racialized immigrants' transition to work occurs within institutional relations of power that coordinate individuals' daily practices of entering the Canadian labour market.

Another important aspect of the changing landscape pertains to the ethnic composition of researchers who authored these studies. With a few exceptions (Mizzi, 2013; Slade, 2009), most of the researchers who in the past 21 years have presented studies on issues of immigration are racialized minorities and are foreign-born. They have contributed significantly to the emerging critical scholarship in studies related to immigration-related topics. As Preissle (2006) observed, "Just as what we are doing has diversified in the past four decades so too has who is doing it. We are no longer men, no longer white, no longer even disciplinary experts" (p. 689). Without jumping to a hasty conclusion, it is imperative to speculate about why mainly adult educators from racialized minority backgrounds are engaged in research related to immigration issues. Could it be because Canadian-born adult educators, particularly Caucasian Canadians, have not considered these issues important or relevant because they do not see themselves as immigrants, despite the fact that Canada is a nation of immigrants? If so, the question of who is a "real" Canadian and who is trapped in the category of "immigrant" for their whole life, and on what basis, deserves more robust debate. How do we define immigrant? Is it by place of birth, length of stay, or skin colour? Putting this debate aside for now, it seems safe to say that the divide between "us" and "them" still lingers in the field of adult education.

The rich diversity of topics, theoretical frameworks, and research methodologies have clearly demonstrated a changing landscape of immigration studies in the context of adult education, characterized by cross-disciplinary and multidisciplinary orientations and activities focusing on the complexity of human experiences with an endeavour to transcend disciplinary boundaries (Preissle, 2006). More importantly, these human experiences are increasingly examined through an intersectional lens that holistically explores the structural,

institutional, systemic, and social dimensions of immigration in Canada, contributing critical perspectives to Canadian adult education.

Racism and Racialization of Immigrants' Experiences

Despite Canada's preference for highly skilled immigrants and despite the fact that immigrants bring significant human capital resources to Canada, many highly educated professional immigrants have encountered difficulties in transitioning to the Canadian labour market owing to racial discrimination and xenophobia (Guo, 2013a; Liu, 2019a). In this regard, one of the most important issues addressed by Canadian adult educators pertains to the devaluation and deskilling of immigrants' prior learning and work experience. A number of studies uncovered the experiences of both regulated (e.g., accountants, engineers, nurses, medical doctors, and teachers) and unregulated professionals (e.g., academia, business, human resources, and IT), and its subsequent impact on immigrants' new lives in Canada (Brigham, 2008; Guo, 2005, 2013b; Kelly & Cui, 2007; Liu, 2017, 2018; Maitra, 2016; Nsg et al., 2008; Shan, 2008, 2013a). While some presentations focused on barriers that prevented immigrant professionals from entering the racialized labour market, other studies attempted to deconstruct the dominant foreign credential discourses associated with knowledge, social identities, and power relationships (Cui, 2008; Maitra, 2016; Shan, 2008; Zhu, 2014) or traced the root causes of the devaluation phenomenon (Guo, 2005, 2013a, 2013b, 2015c). Liu (2017, 2018) argued that devaluation of foreign credentials that has trapped immigrants in incomparable occupations is produced by institutionalized sanctioning, which erects unnecessary barriers between immigrant workers and both employers and professional bodies in Canada. The devaluation of immigrants' credentials is an attempt to regulate immigrants' prior learning and skills, contradictorily filtering immigrants' participation in the Canadian labour market while simultaneously inviting them to make economic contributions. Additionally, Guo's (2015a, 2015b, 2015c) study on employment market transitions of recent immigrants in Canada showed that immigrants' experiences are racialized through the operation of a hierarchical skills regime based on skin colour rather than qualifications. Guo (2015b) further asserted that it is the "colour" of the skill associated with immigrants' skin colour rather than the skill itself that causes the deskilling and devaluation.

To further break down by ethnicity, the racialized experiences of Chinese immigrants in Canada has been especially well explored in the past 20 years. As one of the oldest and largest immigrant groups in Canada, the Chinese population in Canada is estimated to have reached 1.6 million, accounting for 4.6% of the total population and 20.5% of the visible minority population (Statistics Canada, 2016). It is not surprising that 21 (15.7%) of all 134 CASAE immigrant-related presentations found in this study focused on the experience of Chinese immigrants, particularly recent arrivals from the People's Republic of China. Research shows that recent Chinese immigrants are a substantially different group from their predecessors (Guo & DeVoretz, 2006). In particular, since the mid-1990s, an unprecedented number of independent immigrant professionals with post-secondary education (60.5%) have been admitted into Canada. However, many of them have encountered multifaceted barriers to their integration into Canadian society, with employment and language as the most frequently cited barriers. Canadian adult educators further contextualized these issues with Chinese immigrant engineers and

doctors (Shan, 2006, 2016) as well as Chinese professional immigrant women (Ng et al., 2008). The findings indicate that racism does not work in isolation; rather, it interacts with the neo-liberal discourses of structural power and relations, which are the central force that drives racialized institutional practices, reproducing ideological perceptions of immigrants' learning and skills and channelling immigrants into a segregated labour market.

Gendered Experiences of Immigrant Women

As a form of identity, gender is a fundamental principle of social organization and an identity that, as constituted by the production of knowledge about it, confers privilege and concession (Dei, 1995; Nelson & Robinson, 2000). Of the 134 immigration-related presentations in CASAE proceedings, 30 focused on immigrant women and their experiences of settlement and integration in Canada. It is worth noting, however, that there are proportionately fewer studies of immigrant women in the decade after 2010 than in the preceding decade, dropping from 45% of the total number of immigration-related presentations from 2000 to 2010 to 10% from 2011 to 2020. The decline in the percentage of presentations on immigrant women relative to the total number of immigration-related studies indicates the stringent demands entailed by studying immigrant women and their experiences in the context of Canadian immigration, particularly the challenge of transcending a descriptive approach and analyzing women's local experiences of the multiple layers of institutional structures and social relations. A review of studies on immigrant women in CASAE proceedings should start by introducing the very first discussion of immigrant women in CASAE conference history at a roundtable convened by three pioneer feminist scholars: Roxana Ng, Mojab Shahrzad, and Kiran Mirchandani from the University of Toronto (Mojab et al., 2000). Their roundtable discussed the failure of training programs to challenge the ghettoization of immigrant women in contingent and peripheral jobs and explored the ways in which immigrant women learn to resist racialized and gendered exclusion in state approaches to training. This roundtable discussion was informed theoretically by intersectionality, and it established a solid foundation for studies of immigrant women in subsequent CASAE conferences.

Studies of immigrant women over the last 20 years clearly render the multiple barriers that immigrant women face—owing to their disadvantages in gender, class, and race—in accessing the labour market. It is evident that their experiences are clearly gendered, racialized, and classed (Fenwick & Mirchandani, 2004; Maitra, 2015; Ng et al., 2008; Shan, 2013b). One of the major issues raised by these studies was how immigrant women, through their participation in work-related learning, were measured according to Western standardization and ideology. Ng et al. (2008), for example, examined how highly skilled immigrant professional women learned to reorient and reshape their skills, experiences, and aspirations to secure employment in the Canadian labour market. Thus, immigrant women's self-values are hardly considered to be of an authentic Canadian standard due to their physical, ethnic, and cultural identity. This learning socializes their ways of knowing and asks them to comply with certain pre-existing workplace knowledges and values (Maitra, 2015, 2016). Asadi and Pillay's (2017) study fleshed out this analysis, emphasizing how immigrants' knowledge is gendered and racialized through the perpetuation of neo-liberal ideology and hegemony, which shapes immigrant women's recognition of values in knowledge systems and ways of being.

While most of the studies of immigrant women in CASAE proceedings explored structural problems, there is a growing interest in understanding immigrant mothers as a socially constructed norm ingrained in immigrants' lived activities in Canada. Zhu (2013) examined Chinese immigrant mothers who engaged with educational programs in Toronto and argued that a social and cultural imperialism, and particular ideas about race, gender, and class inequalities, shape the organization of these educational programs, thus producing these women's daily practices as those of the ideal immigrant mother. Zhu (2014) subsequently found that immigrant mothering practices are deemed to be different and are devalued based on the Canadian norms of parenting that circulate through parenting education programs, and this differentiation challenges the theory and practice in Canadian-centred parenting education and comprehension. Therefore, the immigrant mother is situated within unequal racial, social, cultural, and economic relations that are themselves entangled with patriarchal, institutional, and structural hierarchies of power. This situated entanglement positions immigrant mothers as a socially formulated disadvantaged group, squeezing themselves into multiple social ideologies and praxis.

Inadequate Discussion of Classed Immigrants

In intersectionality, class is an essential social identity that researchers can empirically map for individuals' social practices and activities. Class can be the consequence of disadvantaged lived experiences. It can also be the central median to not only understand the reasons but the making of these oppressed trajectories (Ng, 1998). Our review of CASAE proceedings reveals that there has been inadequate discussion of class, compared to race and gender, in relation to immigration and immigrants' experiences. From 2000 to 2020, 20 of the 134 immigration-related presentations examined class in relation to social inequality and marginalization. Most of these presentations incorporated class into their larger discussions, and only five specifically used class as a theoretical concept to examine its dimensions as a productive process and constitutive feature of the appropriation and exploitation that characterize social relations of oppression (Carpenter et al., 2020; Fenwick & Mirchandani, 2004; Zhu, 2014).

The discussions of class in CASAE proceedings during the post-2000 period are expanding, moving from understanding class as a social status to more complex examinations of the precarious nature of work and learning for immigrants, characterized by part-time employment, low wages, job insecurity, high risk of poor health, and limited social benefits and statutory entitlements (Guo, 2013a; Liu, 2019a). A few studies have addressed immigrants' classed social locations and barriers in their labour market participation. For example, Livingstone (2011) asserted that recent immigrants who are non-White and mostly women had much higher underemployment rates than White males. Those who immigrated since 1990 have a credential underemployment rate of over 50%. Similarly, Smith and Fernandez (2017) highlighted a significant wage gap in monthly wages for immigrants compared to native-born Canadians in almost all occupational fields, ranging from \$223 to \$601.

Immigrant women are especially vulnerable to the perils of commodified labour (Mojab, 1999; Ng, 1999). As Fuller and Vosko (2008) found, non-permanent female staff have fewer labour rights and work protections, receive lower pay, have no entitlements to paid holidays, and work with poorer health and safety outcomes. Their already lower-class

positions are reinforced when they provide cheap, docile labour to the state under exploitive conditions of employment, which are often permeated with racism and sexism (Ng & Shan, 2010). In examining the experience of South Asian female immigrant workers, Maitra (2016) illustrated the precarious working situations that channelled these women toward self-employment and home-based businesses. She also observed that this racialized and gendered ideology positions immigrant women as a precarious social class, requiring that they be self-disciplined and conform to the neo-liberal discourse of individualism and market competition.

Studies have shown that precarious employment leads to immigrants' social downward mobility, detrimentally affecting their economic integration. Analyzing classed immigrants' lived experiences through a class-dominant approach is circumscribed since it views individuals in economically reductionist terms by prioritizing class above other variables without "understanding the different ways that they are slotted into the capitalist economy, and over and underrepresented in various class sites" (Satzewich, 2018, p. 332). As such, it is important that future research on class, immigration, and adult education recognize how the intersection of class with race and gender operates to undermine an immigrant's training, education, and knowledge to guard the employment gate, maintain segregated social structures, and perpetuate class distinctions. Knowledge production is situated in racialized and gendered institutional and structural power, and workers mobilize their lived experiences with diverse social resources to restore and realign both their class position and their sense of self in the context of a host society devaluing their worth (Fenwick & Mirchandani, 2004; Mojab et al., 2000). Carpenter and Mojab (2011) maintained that immigrants' knowledge is produced by all classes as they are embedded in human historical projects and existing social relations. However, the gendered and racial division of labour persists such that knowledge has become "a class-based activity," and thus certain forms of knowledge are legitimated under capitalism (p. 10).

The Missing Voice from the LGBTQ Immigrant Community

Gender and sexuality are socially and culturally constructed and historically contingent. Due to the fluidity and diversity in gender and sexual identities and the development of individual life histories, human nature cannot be captured by simple binaries. An intersectional framework that integrates insights from LGBTQ studies allows scholars to further complicate these binaries and has the potential to transform studies of LGBTQ individuals and communities of colour. LGBTQ studies propose a politics of difference in response to the limitations of identity politics (Baldo, 2008). This study questions the assumptions of identity and its politics, contesting the notion that sexuality is a stable identity that is specific to lesbian and gay lifestyles, practices, and cultural expressions (Fotopoulou, 2010). LGBTQ studies provide a lens for deconstructing the various factors that feed into heteronormativity to understand how structural pillars contribute to certain individuals' negotiations within their competing and harmonious social identities. This fluidity, variability, and temporality of interactive processes is woven into the relations between and within multiple social groups, institutions, and social attributes and practices.

In adult education there is very little research about the learning experiences of sexual minority immigrants in Canada (Eichler & Mizzi, 2013). Our review of CASAE proceedings found only one paper that addressed the LGBTQ immigrant community. Canadian scholar

Robert C. Mizzi from the University of Manitoba explored what and how homophobic and racist behaviours expressed toward LGBTQ immigrants in the workplace affected safety and inclusiveness and have gone unchecked and unmediated. Adopting the tenets of (post-)colonialism, post-modernism, and post-structuralism, Mizzi (2013) contested how various forms of social regulation caused gay male immigrants to problematize how Canada's multicultural identity is still plagued by homophobic and racist undertones. In examining the difficulties that LGBTQ immigrants face, Mizzi conceptualized the contexts that jeopardize learning and teaching practices and highlighted a different reality of settlement and work for immigrants in Canada. Moreover, this study deconstructed the heteronormative language used to discuss immigrants in Canada and started to address the absence of studies of sexual diversity in immigration and adult education.

Community-Based, Action-Oriented Research

Community-based research is a collaborative partnership that combines systematic inquiry, participation, and action to address community and organizational social phenomena (Minkler, 2005). Of 134 CASAE conference presentations considered for this study, 14 embraced community-based, action-oriented research in searching for community responses to the aforementioned racialized, gendered, classed, and homophobic experiences confronting immigrants in Canada. The first study along these lines that appeared in CASAE proceedings examined the central role that immigrant service organizations have played in fostering a learning community for adult immigrants (Guo, 2004). In the same vein, Shan et al. (2018) explored how immigrant career preparation and a training program functioned in the development of immigrant and refugee women's employment skills and opportunities. This joint project between a Canadian university, a community college, an immigrant service organization, and a non-profit community organization revealed that the employment training program helped construct women's cultural and legal knowledge in employment practices and enhanced women's confidence and self-esteem, maximizing their social and economic participation in local society. The authors further pointed out how this vocational training program can be a means to strive for social change through a set of women-centred practices. This program also challenged a deficit approach to immigrant education and drew on immigrant women's knowledge and resources in identifying their employment potentials, offering opportunities for employment and social integration into the local community, and planting the seeds for multilayered social possibilities.

Rooted in the ideals of education for social change and learning for social action, community-based studies conducted in collaboration with immigrant community organizations often work methodologically to endorse an intersectional analysis of race, class, and gender (Butterwick & Selman, 2020). Butterwick and Villagante (2013), for instance, conducted collaborative work with the Philippine Women Centre in Vancouver through organizing fashion shows. These community-based practices were articulated as a methodology and an "oppositional technology of power" that provided racialized immigrant women with reflexive learning spaces to revisit colonial history and renegotiate their intersectional identities, embracing both inner sensibilities and outer forms of social praxis (Butterwick & Villagante, 2013, p. 73). In a similar study, Kteily-Hawa et al. (2020) conducted a community action-oriented research project to evaluate the effectiveness of using culturally relevant stories—participants' intersectional narratives—as a model for

sexual health education among South Asian women in the Greater Toronto Area. The authors found that the effectiveness of these stories as models for sexual health education was limited because most of the reflexive stories were positive. They neglected immigrant women's oppression in intersectional and intergenerational contexts, thus isolating their lived experiences as unmindful interventions that become counterproductive and harmful.

Discussion and Conclusion

This study analyzes research on immigration and adult education in Canada as represented in proceedings of CASAE annual conferences from 1981 to 2020. The analysis focused on the purpose and research questions of the studies, theoretical traditions, methodological approaches, research findings, and implications. The results show that despite Canada's rich history of immigration and its long tradition of adult education serving marginalized groups, there has been a lack of interest among Canadian adult educators in research related to immigration. The limited number of presentations with an immigration focus that do exist, however, exhibit a rich diversity of topics, theoretical frameworks, and research methodologies, which clearly demonstrate a changing landscape in adult education, characterized by complex cross-disciplinary and multidisciplinary orientations and activities. Furthermore, there is a growing community of scholars, including those from racialized minority backgrounds, who have contributed significantly to the emerging critical scholarship in studies related to issues of immigration, racialization, multiculturalism, anti-racism, and cultural diversity.

Five common themes have emerged from this analysis: racism and racialization of immigrants' experiences, gendered experiences of immigrant women, inadequate discussion of class, the missing voice from the LGBTQ immigrant community, and community-based and action-oriented research. From an intersectional perspective, racism and racialization in immigrants' experiences of work and learning is an issue that has drawn attention of many adult educators in the past 40 years, while many studies also underscored the importance of gendered experiences of immigrant women with respect to their labour market and social integration in Canada. However, there has been inadequate discussion of immigrants' experiences of class, and very little has been written about the LGBTQ immigrant community. As such, it is imperative for Canadian adult education to go beyond the original triple analysis to examine how race, gender, class, and sexual orientation intersect to shape the experiences of adult learners in producing social inequality.

The above discussion also reveals that although Canadian adult educators have incrementally integrated a holistic approach to the analysis of immigration, much work needs to be done to move us forward. Despite its long-standing commitment to social justice, this analysis demonstrates that adult education has played a dual role in responding to immigration and cultural diversity as both constrainer and enabler (Guo, 2015a, 2015c). Immigrants' racialized, gendered, classed, and homophobic experiences in relation to their work and learning suggest that adult education has created a system of exclusion and a model of social control. In this sense, adult education has failed to respond positively to the changing needs of adult immigrants and failed to embrace cultural diversity and difference that adult immigrant learners bring to adult education settings. On the other hand, community-based, action-oriented research indicates that adult education has

created important spaces for emancipatory learning and social action. In this view, adult education remains an enabler.

To build a socially just and inclusive adult education that goes beyond the triple analytic framework, we propose an integrative intersectional framework that uses an intersectional lens to inquire into immigrants' experiences and to foster an adult education environment in which marginalized social groups can contend with social inequalities. This framework acknowledges and affirms intersectional identities and diversity as positive and desirable assets. The integrative intersectional framework can be understood in three ways. First, this framework focuses on marginalized groups to create space for the expression of autonomy in their experience and perspectives. This voice-giving approach emphasizes the significance of single social existence and its interrelations to the discussion of autonomy, relations within and among diverse social groups, and relational mechanisms that reinforce social stratification. It seeks to balance freedom of mobility with protection, recognition, and membership and to reconstitute learning spaces as sites of agency in marginalized social groups' experiences and perspectives. Second, the integrative intersectional framework not only seeks to explore the independence of every social category, such as race, gender, class, and sexual orientation, but goes beyond the saliency of one social dominance. It underscores the interconnection between each social existence and the material conditions and processes that reproduce social relations. Third, this framework unveils the polarization and segregation of disadvantaged individual actors and untangles the threads of socially oppressed social locations within diverse power relations. It emphasizes that racialized immigrants are actors and agents of change with reference to the specifics of everyday reality through the struggle for identity and inequality in the context of externally regulated social demands. Thus, this approach allows adult educators to examine the internal and external layers of complexity between social categories and structural power, constructing a more integrative landscape to capture social and power relations.

In celebrating CASAE's accomplishments over the past 40 years, this study points to new directions for Canadian adult education that take us beyond the status quo. As Canada is becoming more ethnoculturally diverse as a result of growing immigration, it is imperative for adult education to continue its long-standing commitment to social justice by working toward a more inclusive adult education that is focused on the benefits of marginalized adult learners. Therefore, it is essential that Canadian adult educators take up these issues and examine how different social categories interact to shape the social locations of recent immigrants.

References

- Asadi, N., & Pillay, T. (2017). Cognitive justice for racialized settlers in Canada: A narrative approach. In *Proceedings of the 36th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 42–48). Ryerson University.
- Baldo, M. (2008). Queer in Italian—North American women writers. *Graduate Journal of Social Science*, 5(2), 35–62.
- Brigham, S. (2008). Seeing straight ahead with Pierre Bourdieu: Female immigrant teachers in an arts-informed research inquiry. In *Proceedings of the 27th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 42–48). University of British Columbia.
- Butterwick, S., & Selman, J. (2020). Using participatory theatre to disrupt reactive and divisive public discourse: Arts-based opportunities in adult education. In *Proceedings of the Adult Education in Global Times conference* (pp. 91–97). University of British Columbia.
- Butterwick, S., & Villagante, K. (2013). The political fashion shows of Filipino activists: Speaking/wearing truth to power. In *Proceedings of the 32nd annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 68–73). University of Victoria.
- Carpenter, S., Elias, P., Hassan, Z., & McCready, L. (2020). Walls built upon walls: Understanding intersectional barriers to post-secondary education. In *Proceedings of the Adult Education in Global Times conference* (pp. 98–106). University of British Columbia.
- Carpenter, S., & Mojab, S. (2011). Introduction: A specter haunts adult education: Crafting a Marxist-feminist framework for adult education and learning. In S. Carpenter & S. Mojab (Eds.), *Educating from Marx: Race, gender, and learning* (pp. 3–18). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Cho, S. (2013). Post-intersectionality: The curious reception of intersectionality in legal scholarship. *Du Bois Review: Social Science Research on Race*, 10(2), 385–404. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1742058X13000362>
- Cho, S., Crenshaw, K. W., & McCall, L. (2013). Toward a field of intersectionality studies: Theory, applications and praxis. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 38(4), 785–810. <https://doi.org/10.1086/669608>
- Choo, H. Y., & Ferree, M. M. (2010). Practicing intersectionality in sociological research: A critical analysis of inclusions, interactions, and institutions in the study of inequalities. *Sociological Theory*, 28(2), 129–149. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9558.2010.01370.x>
- Chun, J. J., Lipsitz, G., & Shin, Y. (2013). Intersectionality as a social movement strategy: Asian immigrant women advocates. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 38(4), 917–940. <https://doi.org/10.1086/669575>
- Collins, P. H., & Bilge, S. (2016). *Intersectionality*. Polity.
- Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory and antiracist politics. In K. Bartlett (Ed.), *Feminist legal theory: Readings in law and gender* (pp. 57–80). Routledge.
- Crenshaw, K. (1991). Mapping the margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color. *Stanford Law Review*, 43(6), 1241–1299. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1229039>
- Crenshaw, K. (1993). Beyond racism and misogyny: Black feminism and 2 Live Crew. In M. J. Matsuda, C. R. Lawrence, R. Delgado, & K. W. Crenshaw (Eds.), *Words that wound: Critical race theory, assaultive speech, and the first amendment* (pp. 111–132). Routledge.
- Cui, D. (2008). Deconstructing foreign credential recognition discourses. In *Proceedings of the 27th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 75–80). University of British Columbia.
- Dei, G. S. (1995). Integrative anti-racism: Intersection of race, class, and gender. *Race, Gender, and Class*, 2(3), 11–30.

- Eichler, M., & Mizzi, R. (2013). Negotiating the confluence: Middle-Eastern, immigrant, sexual-minority men and concerns for learning and identity. *Brock Education*, 22(2), 84–98. <https://doi.org/10.26522/brocked.v22i2.344>
- Fenwick, T., & Mirchandani, K. (2004). Race, gender and networks in portfolio work: Difficult knowledge. In *Proceedings of the AERC and CASAE joint conference* (pp. 142–147). University of Victoria.
- Fuller, S., & Vosko, L. F. (2008). Temporary employment and social inequality in Canada: Exploring intersections of gender, race and immigration status. *Social Indicators Research*, 88(1), 31–50.
- Guo, S. (2004). Citizenship, immigration and adult education: The role of immigrant service organization in building a learning community for adult immigrants. In *Proceedings of the 23rd annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education*. University of Victoria.
- Guo, S. (2005). Difference, deficiency, and devaluation: Non-recognition of foreign credentials for immigrant professionals in Canada. In *Proceedings of the 24th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 124–130). Western University.
- Guo, S. (2013a). Economic integration of recent Chinese immigrants in Canada's second-tier cities: The triple glass effect and immigrants' downward social mobility. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 45(3), 95–115. <http://doi.org/10.1353/ces.2013.0047>
- Guo, S. (2013b). The triple glass effect and immigrant's downward social mobility: Implications for adult education. In *Proceedings of the 35th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 205–210). University of Victoria.
- Guo, S. (2015a). The changing nature of adult education in the age of transnational migration: Toward a model of recognitive adult education. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 2015(146), 7–17. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ace.20127>
- Guo, S. (2015b). The colour of skill: Contesting a racialised regime of skill from the experience of recent immigrants in Canada. *Studies in Continuing Education*, 37(3), 236–250. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0158037X.2015.1067766>
- Guo, S. (2015c). Researching transnational migration and adult education: Toward a model of recognitive adult education. In *Proceedings of the 34th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 138–143). University of Montreal.
- Guo, S., & DeVoretz, D. J. (2006). Chinese immigrants in Vancouver: Quo vadis? *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 7(4), 425–447. <https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007/BF02934903.pdf>
- Guo, S., & Guo, Y. (2021). Combating racism and xenophobia in Canada: Toward pandemic anti-racism education in post-COVID-19. *Beijing International Review of Education*, 3(2), 187–211. https://brill.com/view/journals/bire/3/2/article-p187_187.xml
- Guo, S., & Wong, L. (2018). Immigration, racial and ethnic studies in 150 years of Canada: An introduction. In S. Guo & L. Wong (Eds.), *Immigration, racial and ethnic studies in 150 years of Canada: Retrospects and prospects* (pp. 1–17). Brill | Sense Publishers.
- Hsieh, H. F., & Shannon, S. E. (2005). Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. *Qualitative Health Research*, 15(9), 1277–1288.
- Kaushik, V., & Walsh, C. A. (2018). A critical analysis of the use of intersectionality theory to understand the settlement and integration needs of skilled immigrants to Canada. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 50(3), 27–47. <https://doi.org/10.1353/ces.2018.0021>
- Kelly, J., & Cui, D. (2007). Immigration and credentialing: A case study of Jamaican teachers in 1960s Alberta. In *Proceedings of the AERC and CASAE joint conference* (pp. 343–348). Mount St. Vincent University.
- Kteily-Hawa, R., Chikermane, V., Vahabi, M., Vijayanathan, H., Soor, J., Chambers, L. A., & Wong, J. P. H. (2020). Story sharing as a culturally relevant approach in adult sexual health education. In *Proceedings of the Adult Education in Global Times conference* (pp. 385–392). University of British Columbia.
- Lewis, G. (2009). Celebrating intersectionality? Debates on a multi-faceted concept in gender studies: Themes from a conference. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 16(3), 203–210.
- Liu, J. (2017). Towards social equality in transnational migration and adult education: A critical analysis of immigrants experience from an intersectionality perspective. In *Proceedings of the 36th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 238–244). Ryerson University.
- Liu, J. (2018). The changing nature of work in the age of immigration: Exploring work experiences of immigrant workers in Canada. In *Proceedings of the 37th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 150–155). University of Regina.
- Liu, J. (2019a). The precarious nature of work in the context of Canadian immigration: An intersectional analysis. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 51(2), 169–186.
- Liu, J. (2019b). Working within an intersectional subjectivity: Exploring settlement workers' workplace learning at immigrant service organizations in Canada. In *Proceedings of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 215–221). University of British Columbia.
- Livingstone, D. (2011). Probing the icebergs of workplace learning: Findings of the 1998, 2004 and 2010 surveys of work and lifelong learning. In *Proceedings of the 52nd national conference of the Adult Education Research Conference* (pp. 408–414). University of Toronto.
- Maitra, S. (2015). Between conformity and contestation: South Asian immigrant women negotiating soft skill training in Canada. *Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education*, 27(2), 65–78.
- Maitra, S. (2016). Negotiating soft skill training: Examining the training/learning experiences of highly educated South Asian immigrant women in Canada. In *Proceedings of the 35th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 218–223). University of Calgary.
- McCall, L. (2005). The complexity of intersectionality. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 30(3), 1771–1800.
- Minkler, M. (2005). Community-based research partnerships: Challenges and opportunities. *Journal of Urban Health*, 82(2). https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3456439/pdf/11524_2006_Article_391.pdf
- Mizzi, R. (2013). Finding love in a hopeful place: Unravelling motivations, mistruths, and movements of queer immigrants at work. In *Proceedings of the 32nd annual conference*

- of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education (pp. 392–398). University of Victoria.
- Mizzi, R. (2016). Beyond silos of “sexuality”, “ethnicity”, and “language”: Educator identity and practice in adult education contexts. In C. Schmidt & J. Schneider (Eds.), *Diversifying the teaching force in transnational contexts: Critical perspectives* (pp. 115–125). Sense Publishers.
- Mojab, S. (1999). De-skilling immigrant women. *Canadian Woman Studies*, 19(3), 123–128.
- Mojab, S., Ng, R., & Mirchandani, K. (2000). Immigrant women and labour flexibility: Resisting training through learning. In *Proceedings of the AERC and CASAE joint conference*. University of British Columbia.
- Mukherjee, A., & Copper, E. (1987). Race relations training for school administrators and employees: An adult education model. In *Proceedings of the 6th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 168–187). McMaster University.
- Neal, R. (1998). *Brotherhood economics: Women and co-operatives in Nova Scotia*. Cape Breton University Press.
- Nelson, A., & Robinson, B. (2000). *Gender in Canada* (2nd ed.). Prentice Hall.
- Ng, R. (1998). Work restructuring and recolonizing third world women: An example from the garment industry in Toronto. *Canadian Woman Studies*, 18(1), 21–25.
- Ng, R. (1999). Homeworking: Dream realized or freedom constrained? The globalized reality of immigrant garment workers. *Canadian Woman Studies/Cahiers de La Femme*, 19(3), 110–114.
- Ng, R., Man, G., & Shan, H. (2008). Learning to be an immigrant: Professional immigrant women navigating the Canadian labour market. In *Proceedings of the 28th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education*. University of British Columbia.
- Ng, R., & Shan, H. (2010). Lifelong learning as ideological practice: An analysis from the perspective of immigrant women in Canada. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 29(2), 169–184. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02601371003616574>
- Patton, M. (2014). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods: Integrating theory and practice*. Sage Publications.
- Preissle, J. (2006). Envisioning qualitative inquiry: A view across four decades. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 19(6), 685–695.
- Satzewich, V. (2018). The future of ethnic and racial studies. In S. Guo & L. Wong (Eds.), *Immigration, racial and ethnic studies in 150 years of Canada: Retrospects and prospects* (pp. 325–340). Brill | Sense.
- Selman, G., Cooke, M., Selman, M., & Dampier, P. (1998). *The foundations of adult education in Canada*. Thompson Educational Publishing.
- Shan, H. (2006). Learning on the periphery: Chinese immigrants coping with the regulatory practices of the medical profession in Canada. In *Proceedings of the 25th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 197–202). York University.
- Shan, H. (2008). The credential and certificate regime in Canada: A social map from the standpoint of immigrant women. In *Proceedings of the 28th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 327–332). University of British Columbia.
- Shan, H. (2013). Professional learning as spatilized practices: Reimagining the pedagogical space for immigrants. In *Proceedings of the 32nd annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 549–555). University of Victoria.
- Shan, H. (2016). Knowledge “transfer” as unfolding practice: Experiences of internationally trained engineers. In *Proceedings of the 35th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 267–273). University of Calgary.
- Shan, H., Wilbur, A., Sawkins, T., Rahemtulla, Z., Peikazadi, N., & Goossen, R. (2018). Training immigrant and refugee women for the hospitality industry: Care-based pedagogies and practices. In *Proceedings of the 37th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 214–218). University of Regina.
- Slade, B. (2009). From high skill to high school: The social organization of “Canadian work experience”, immigration, and volunteer work. In *Proceedings of the annual conference of the Adult Education Research Conference* (pp. 342–247). <https://newprairiepress.org/aerc/2009/papers/60/>
- Smith, W., & Fernandez, F. (2017). Education, skills, and wage gaps in Canada and the United States. *International Migration*, 55(3), 57–73. <https://doi.org/10.1111/imig.12328>
- Statistics Canada. (2016). *Canadian demographics at a glance*. Statistics Canada (Vol. 91). <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/catalogue/91-003-X>
- Viruell-Fuentes, E. A., Miranda, P. Y., & Abdulrahim, S. (2012). More than culture: Structural racism, intersectionality theory, and immigrant health. *Social Science and Medicine*, 75(12), 2099–2106.
- Walsh, S. C., & Brigham, S. M. (2005). The messiness of experience: Immigrant women and an arts-informed research process. In *Proceedings of the 24th annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 32–37). Western University.
- Walter, P. (2003). Imagined nations and imperialism: Frontier College and the construction of British Canada: 1899–1933. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 54(1), 42–58.
- Welton, M. (2001). Navigating in the new world disorder: Global adult education faces the 21st century. *Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education*, 15(1), 47–63.
- Zhu, Y. (2013). Problematizing Canadian breastfeeding educational programs: Taking the standpoint of new Chinese immigrant mother. In *Proceedings of the 32nd annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 642–648). University of Victoria.
- Zhu, Y. (2014). Deconstructing knowledge of mothering in adult education: Chinese immigrant mothers in Canadian parenting education programs. In *Proceedings of the 33rd annual conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 295–300). Brock University.